

## Parking Garage- COA Comments

**Blue: Visual compatibility**

**Yellow: Design standards- variance or revision required**

**Pink: Need more info**

*Italicized: Staff comments*

**Visual Compatibility Criteria.** Development or redevelopment activity shall be considered compatible with the contributing structures to which the structure is visually related in terms of the following requirements.

**Height.** The height of proposed structures shall be visually compatible with contributing structures on the same block face.

**Proportion of Building's Front Façade.** The relationship of the width of the structure to the height of the front elevation shall be visually compatible with contributing structures to which it is visually related.

*The overall height is not visually compatible with surrounding contributing buildings. The 2-story wood framed residential buildings that surround the property are significantly lower in height; at a minimum this building should be redesigned to step down to the buildings to the south. The height also overwhelms that of the adjacent historic church, which as a monumental building, should dominant surrounding buildings due to its community significance. Although the peak of the historic church may be comparable in height to the top of the parapet height of this building, the church's eave and tower heights are significantly lower which are the bar for the perceived overall height of the church.*

**Proportion of Openings Within the Facility.** The relationship of the width of the windows to height of windows in a building shall be visually compatible with contributing structures to which the structure is visually related.

*The proportions of the openings are not visually compatible. The large arched second story openings are more characteristic of a monumental building. This site is setback off Bull Street into a residential area of the district. Staff recommends that the scale of the arched openings be reduced into multiple smaller bays. Contributing buildings tend to have regular rhythms of punched openings.*

*The glass towers should be redesigned to be more compatible with the residential character in the immediate surrounding area.*

*Add more articulation to the south façade as it will be highly visible; the articulation does not need to consist of actual openings.*

**Rhythm of Buildings on Street.** The relationship of a structure to the open space between it and adjacent structures shall be visually compatible with the open spaces between contributing structures to which it is visually related.

*The rhythm is visually compatible.*

**Rhythm of Entrance and Porch Projection.** Entrances, porch projections and walkways to the proposed structure shall be visually compatible with contributing structures to which they are visually related.

*The entrances are visually compatible. Human entrances are provided along each street.*

**Relationship of Materials, Texture.** The relationship of materials, texture and color of the facade of a structure shall be visually compatible with the predominate materials used on contributing structures to which it is visually related.

*Materials proposed on the building are aluminum storefront, aluminum composite panels, brick, cementitious composite shiplap siding, a metal cross-braced screening system, large expanses of glass, and metal awnings.*

*The applicant provided examples of buildings in the district that use metal on their exterior; staff recommends that the configuration of the panels, which are currently large rectangular sections of panel separated by joints, be redesigned to be more compatible with the vertical metal used on the exterior of the applicant's example buildings.*

*With regard to the metal cross-braced screening system within many of the openings, the applicant provided examples of buildings within the Landmark District, not within the Mid-City District, that use a similar system. This system is not visually compatible with contributing buildings within the district especially in such large expanses and quantities.*

*Cementitious composite shiplap siding is proposed on the exterior of the trash room along De Soto Avenue; staff recommends this be changed to one of the other materials used on the project.*

**Roof Shapes.** The roof shape of a building shall be visually compatible with contributing structures to which it is visually related.

*The roof shapes are visually compatible. The main roof has 4 foot high parapet walls; this is a common feature on contributing buildings. The stair towers have "flat" roofs without a parapet wall and a minimal overhang; the applicant provided mid-century building examples within this district that have similar flat roof configurations.*

**Scale of a Building.** The mass of a structure, and the size of window and door openings, porches and balconies shall be visually compatible with contributing structures to which they are visually related.

*Generally, the large scale of the building (as well as its individual components such as the large arched openings) is not visually compatible.*

## **Development Standards.**

*On March 29, 2018, City Council adopted an amendment to the Mid-City zoning ordinance [File No. 18-000592-ZA]. The amendment focuses on changes to the CIV zoning district which specifically apply to each PIN within this project site. Although this site is still zoned TN-2, some CIV standards now apply as can be seen below.*

- (1) **Civic and Institutional (CIV) District.** The CIV District is intended to provide for civic and institutional district uses that serve a large area or produce insensitive activities not readily assimilated into other districts.
- (b) All commercial uses listed in table Sec. 8-3125,(1),(a) shall be permitted only when associated with a public or civic facility except as provided in 8-3215(6).

*Principal use parking structures are permitted.*

- (6) **Redevelopment of CIV District Parcels with Civic and Institutional Uses.**

To encourage the re-use of parcels with contributing buildings originally-designed for religious or education-related uses, it may be desirable to allow for flexibility with regards to principal uses and development standards for such parcels and associated or adjacent parcels, when appropriate. Because these parcels are unique as to their location and surroundings, the extent to which flexibility may be allowed must be considered on an individual parcel basis. Associated and adjacent parcels may be included provided that their development or redevelopment is related to the parcel with the contributing building. Parcels include:

(a) **Former Epworth Methodist Church.**

- i. For the parcel with the parcel identification number of **2-0065-29-001**, the TN-2 principal uses and standards shall apply with the following exceptions:

- (1) The ground floor area shall be the same as permitted by the CIV district.

*The ground floor area permitted by the CIV district is not specifically identified and is, therefore, unlimited. The ground floor area is approximately 7,749 square feet.*

- (2) There shall be no minimum garage or street or rear yard setbacks.

*The lot is not square therefore the setbacks vary along the same property line: 0-11" along the west, 0-10" (with the art display cases projecting forward of the property line 2'-10") along the north, 8-16" along the east, and 5' - 5'-4" along the south.*

- (3) There shall be no building coverage maximum.

*The lot coverage will be 88.5 percent.*

- (4) A structured parking garage shall not be required to be wrapped in residential or nonresidential uses permitted in the district at the ground floor level.

*The parking is not wrapped in "non-parking" uses.*

**Traditional Neighborhood – 2 (TN-2) District.** The TN-2 District is intended to ensure the vibrancy of historic residential neighborhoods with traditional development patterns characteristic of Savannah from 1890 to 1930 during the streetcar and early automobile era. While the district provides for primarily residential streets, it also includes limited non-residential uses that were historically deemed compatible with the residential character of neighborhoods, specifically located as corner stores and limited ground-floor uses.

**Site.**

**Lot Area.** 2,200 square foot minimum for attached residential.  
3,000 square foot minimum for all other uses.

*The lot area is approximately 7,865 square feet.*

**Lot Width.** 30 feet minimum

*The lot is 71.5 feet wide.*

**Building Frontage.** 70% of lot width minimum (for lots less than 31 feet in width, provide either a five foot setback or 70% minimum building frontage)

*The standard is met.*

**Height.**

**Building Height.**

3 stories maximum.

2 stories minimum on block face with any two-story building.

45 feet maximum.

*The building has the visual expression of a 2-story building and is 39 feet high to the top of the stair roof with the elevator overrun extending to 44 feet.*

**Floor Height. Ground floor:** 11 feet minimum.

*The visual expression of the ground floor exceeds 11 feet.*

**Upper floors:** 9 feet minimum.

*The visual expression of the upper floor exceeds 9 feet.*

**Ground Floor Elevation.**

**Corner site:** No minimum.

*The ground floor is at grade.*

**Neighborhood Design Standards.**

The intent of these standards is not to copy the architectural design of the past, but to create a set of contemporary standards that protect existing residential neighborhoods, address the existing character of commercial areas and reinforce the idea of a walkable community.

In order to convey a sense of place, buildings should be prominent in relation to the accommodation of vehicles, and should be situated in a manner consistent with historic development patterns. To promote pedestrian activity on both residential and commercial streets, buildings should be aligned and close to the streets they face.

Building height and vertical proportions of buildings should be in context with contributing structures in the same or adjacent block faces. The mass of the building should be broken-down both horizontally and vertically to convey a sense of human scale and visual interest that reflects the traditional size of buildings.

New construction, including accessory structures, shall comply with all of the standards of this section.

Where a material change in the exterior appearance of any existing building by addition, reconstruction or alteration is proposed, such change shall be consistent with the intent of each section below.

**Foundations.** Foundations that match the traditional pattern of construction in height and materials complement the craftsmanship of existing construction. The visual

impression of separate piers is important to the look of traditional construction in the area.

#### **Foundation Construction.**

Slab-on-grade foundations shall be allowed for new construction, provided they meet the minimum elevation requirements for the district.

*Slab-on-grade is proposed; no minimum ground floor elevation is required.*

**Exterior Building Walls.** Exterior building walls should reflect and complement the traditional materials and construction techniques of Savannah's historic regional architecture. Simple configuration and solid craftsmanship are favored over complexity in building form.

#### **Prohibited Materials.**

Exterior building walls on all new structures or additions to existing structures shall not be constructed of the following materials:

Corrugated metal; or

Unpainted, exposed concrete block walls, not including rusticated split-face or architectural profile masonry block.

*None of these prohibited materials are proposed.*

**Configuration.** The following exterior building wall configurations and techniques shall be permitted.

#### **Walls.**

Blank wall areas shall not exceed 15 feet in vertical direction and 30 feet in the horizontal direction along any street.

*The intent of the standard is met along all three streets.*

Joints between different exterior building materials shall be horizontal and continue around corners except for towers, chimneys, and piers.

*The standard is met. The majority of the exterior walls are brick. A metal cross-braced screening system, aluminum composite panels, storefront, and glass all occur within fenestration or as corner tower elements.*

#### **Wood Simulation Materials.**

Materials shall be horizontal in configuration (lap siding).

Materials shall be of a smooth or rough-sawn finish.

*Cementitious composite shiplap siding is proposed on the exterior of the trash room along De Soto Avenue; staff recommends this be changed to one of the other materials used on the project as the small amount of this material on a large building is not appropriate.*

#### **Building Entrances.**

Building entrances shall face the primary street on which the structure is located (normally, the street from which it takes its address).

*The standard is met. Although the property currently has a West 38<sup>th</sup> Street address, the applicant's intent is to change it to a Whitaker Street address and have Whitaker as the primary façade for the new building. Whitaker has a double-door near the corner of 38<sup>th</sup> for pedestrian access to the roof garden; it has a secondary human door adjacent to the central garage door opening.*

There shall be a public building entrance along the primary street at intervals no greater than 50 feet, unless otherwise approved by the Design Administrator.

*The standard is met. Whitaker has two entrances and is 66'-6" long.*

Building entrances on corner lots shall be either oriented in the same direction as entrances of adjacent buildings or oriented toward the corner of the lot.

*The standard is met. There are contributing buildings along Whitaker to the south of this site; their entrances also face Whitaker Street.*

Double-height or two-story entrances shall not be permitted.

*The standard is met.*

Doors shall be of glass, wood, clad wood or steel.

*The standard is met. The non-storefront doors are labeled as "hollow metal doors" and only exist into the trash room along De Soto Avenue.*

#### **Awnings.**

Awnings extending above public sidewalks or other public walkways shall be a minimum of ten feet above the street level.

Non-residential awnings may be constructed of canvas, other equivalent cloth, or metal or glass.

*The standards are met. A metal awning that extends above the public sidewalk is proposed at the northwest corner of the building above the main entrance on the front façade; it provides 10'-8" of clearance above the sidewalk.*

Awnings shall be integrated structurally and architecturally into the design of the façade.

The following shall be prohibited:

Mansard awnings (awnings that cover more than 85 percent of the length of a facade or those that connect two facades).

Back-lit (internally lit) awnings.

*The standards are met.*

**Windows and Doors.** Correct use of windows and doors can enhance pedestrian activity at the street level and can provide a sense of rhythm in the architectural form of both residential and nonresidential buildings. Nonresidential buildings with ground floor storefronts should provide a higher level of transparency and access for connection of outside and interior activities.

#### **Nonresidential Façades.**

Retail uses shall incorporate transparent features (windows and doors) over at least 70 percent of the ground floor façade.

*No retail is proposed.*

All other nonresidential facades visible from the street shall incorporate transparent features (windows and doors) over at least 50 percent of the ground floor façade.

*The standard is not met. Whitaker Street has 49%, West 38<sup>th</sup> Street has 48% (which includes the display cases), and De Soto Avenue has 38%.*

### **Materials.**

Window casings and screens on front façades and on sides where visible from the street (not including public lanes) shall be made of metal, wood, or clad wood material.

Window glass shall be transparent with no dark tints or mirror effects.

*All windows are proposed to be aluminum storefront and it appears that all glass is clear and transparent.*

**Configuration.** The following configurations are permitted.

**All Windows.** The following shall apply to all windows on building elevations visible from the street.

Windows shall be taller than they are wide, except for accent windows, which may be round or other shapes.

*The standard is not met. All of the arched openings are wider than they are tall; they do not qualify as accent windows.*

Windows shall be single-hung, double-hung, awning or casement.

*No true windows are present on the building. If the recommended redesign of the arched openings results in a true window type; ensure that an operable-type permitted by the ordinance is utilized.*

**Storefront Display Windows.** The following shall apply to all storefront display windows.

Displays, shelving and signs shall cover no more than 15 percent of the total window area within three feet of the window's surface, unless display, shelving or signage is transparent.

*The intent of the standard is met. The display cases are 3 feet deep.*

Single panes of glass shall be no larger than six feet vertically by four feet horizontally.

*The standard is met.*

**Roofs.** Roof forms should be designed to provide visual interest and coherence in a manner that is consistent with contributing structures.

**Material.** Roofs that are visible from the public street shall be constructed of the following materials:

- Clay or concrete tile;
- Standing seam (but not corrugated) metal;
- Slate or equivalent synthetic; or
- Asphalt or similar shingles.

*None of the roof materials will be visible from the public street.*

**Configuration.** The following configurations are permitted.

Shed roofs, and porch roofs, subordinate and attached to the primary structure, shall be pitched between 2:12 and 6:12. Where historically appropriate, flat roofs may be employed.

*The standard is met for the flat roof proposed on the “Attendant’s Office” at the east facade.*

Buildings with frontage on Bull Street or Victory Drive may have a roof pitch of less than 4:12 when screened by a parapet wall a minimum of 24 inches high above the roof surface.

*The standard does not apply.*

Skylights, roof decks, pergolas and roof vents are permitted only on the roof plane opposite the street-facing façade, or when screened from street view.

*None of these elements are proposed.*

**Mechanical Equipment.** Mechanical equipment visible from the street increases visual clutter. The correct placement of equipment, screened and out of view, enhances the visual character of the area.

Air compressors, mechanical pumps, water heaters, water softeners, utility meters, utility boxes, air conditioners and other similar types of equipment shall be placed in rear and side yards, and screened from view if visible from the street.

Roof mounted equipment shall be screened from street view by a parapet wall.

*The electric meter is proposed on the De Soto Avenue façade. It is unclear if any other ground or roof mounted HVAC equipment will be required as none is shown on the drawings; provide clarification.*

**Parking.** To create and protect contiguous, active pedestrian street fronts, parking areas should be located to the side and rear of structures.

**Location.** No parking area or parking structure shall be allowed in any required street yard.

*There is not a required street yard.*

**Parking Structures.** This section shall apply only to a stand-alone parking structure, not to a parking structure that is integrated into another principal structure, provided the parking structure does not dominate the principal structure.

**When the parking structure is visible from the street, there shall be no exterior evidence to indicate that the structure is used for parking, except for entrances.**

*The ground floor decorative metal cross-bracing within the openings on the Whitaker façade and decorative metal cross-bracing on the upper floors allow visibility into the parking structure; therefore, the standard is not met.*

Each visible portion of the structure shall be wrapped in residential or nonresidential uses permitted in the district at the ground floor level.

*This site is exempt from the standard to wrap the ground level in residential or nonresidential uses.*

Such parking structures shall conform to all street, side, and rear yard and height requirements of the district.

*The standards are met.*

In-structure parking may extend to within three feet of the rear lot line where parking access is provided from a lane.

*The standard does not apply; there is no lane access.*

**Parking Access.** To enhance pedestrian activity, access and safety, the number of curb cuts should be kept to a minimum.

Where a site has access by way of a rear lane, the lane shall be the sole means of vehicular access to the site.

*The standard does not apply; there is no lane access.*

**Lighting.** Lighting shall be designed in a consistent and coordinated manner. Lighting fixtures should be integrated and designed to blend into the surrounding landscape.

*No specifications or details were provided with the submittal packet.*